



Data - May 2016

The Rise (and Fall) of Middle Wage Industries in NYC

While the share of middle income jobs in New York City has declined over the past couple of decades, there is evidence that industries with middle income wages are staging a bit of a comeback.

by Jonathan Bowles

While the share of middle income jobs in New York City has declined over the past couple of decades, there is evidence that industries with middle income wages are staging a bit of a comeback.

This data brief is a publication of the Center for an Urban Future's Middle Class Jobs Project, a research initiative generously funded by **FISHER BROTHERS** and **WINSTON C. FISHER**.

General operating support for the Center for an Urban Future is provided by the Bernard F. and Alva B. Gimbel Foundation; with additional support from the Lucius N. Littauer Foundation and the M&T Charitable Foundation.

As this analysis shows, middle-wage industries—those with annual salaries between \$40,000 and \$80,000—accounted for 3 of the 8 sectors with a net gain of at least 10,000 jobs. Additionally, the 75 industries producing the greatest job growth between 2011 and 2015 include a near-equal representation of middle-wage sectors (23), low-wage sectors (24) and high-wage sectors (28). And 23 different middle-wage sectors added at least 1,000 jobs during this period.

Despite these positive trends, however, there are clear signs that middle-income industries in New York still lag behind low-wage and high-wage sectors. Overall, middle wage industries added fewer jobs in the five boroughs (110,880) than high-wage industries (112,919) and low-wage industries (169,613).

Middle income sectors also account for a disproportionately large share of the industries that have been shedding jobs in recent years. Of the 75 industries with the most job losses in the city between 2011 and 2015, 34 were middle-wage sectors,

22 were high-wage sectors and 19 were low-wage sectors. In fact, the 14 industries with the largest net-decline in jobs during this period were all in high-wage (9) and middle-wage (5) sectors.

The two industries with the most job gains in the city during this period both were low-wage industries, paying under \$40k. They were:

- Restaurants and other eating places, which had a net gain of 55,145 jobs between 2011 and 2015. Jobs in this industry pay an average of \$25,462
- Home Health Care services, which had a net gain of 37,859 jobs during this period. Jobs in this industry pay an average of \$25,754.

The good news is that there are a number of middle income sectors that have been adding thousands of jobs in the five borough, several of which have potential for more growth in the years ahead. These high-growth sectors span fields from educational services and construction to health care, the arts and transportation. The 23 middle wage sectors that added at least 1,000 jobs in the city between 2011 and 2015 include:

| Industry | % Job Growth | # Job Growth | Wages |
|---------------------------------------|--------------|--------------|----------|
| EMPLOYMENT SERVICES | 29.4% | 17416 | 47769.46 |
| BUILDING EQUIPMENT CONTRACTORS | 28.0% | 12406 | 76340.68 |
| COLLEGES & UNIVERSITIES | 18.4% | 12319 | 73280.47 |
| ELEMENTARY & SECONDARY SCHOOLS | 25.2% | 9304 | 51310.08 |
| SERVICES TO BUILDINGS & DWELLINGS | 19.7% | 6638 | 42258.41 |
| RESIDENTIAL BUILDING CONSTRUCTION | 38.8% | 6528 | 53292.30 |
| HEALTH & PERSONAL CARE STORES | 15.5% | 5973 | 42817.28 |
| TRAVELER ACCOMMODATION | 13.3% | 5859 | 60104.33 |
| ACTIVITIES RELATED TO REAL ESTATE | 17.8% | 5437 | 72476.05 |
| PROMOTERS - PERFORMING ARTS & SPORTS | 36.6% | 3282 | 79912.24 |
| SOCIAL ADVOCACY ORGANIZATIONS | 24.5% | 2695 | 66724.65 |
| GENERAL MEDICAL & SURGICAL HOSPITALS | 1.8% | 2504 | 78555.24 |
| OFFICES OF OTHER HEALTH PRACTITIONERS | 17.8% | 2435 | 42230.68 |
| SCHEDULED AIR TRANSPORTATION | 8.9% | 2433 | 73363.15 |
| MUSEUMS HISTORICAL SITES & SIMILAR | 19.7% | 2352 | 53674.47 |

| Industry | % Job Growth | # Job Growth | Wages |
|--|--------------|--------------|----------|
| SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH & DEVELOPMENT SERV | 10.0% | 1504 | 73079.61 |
| FOUNDATION STRUCTURE & BLDG EXTERIOR | 15.3% | 1470 | 64061.68 |
| COMMUNITY FOOD & HOUSING & EMERGENCY | 14.6% | 1347 | 41094.84 |
| BUILDING FINISHING CONTRACTORS | 9.6% | 1322 | 62601.93 |
| OFFICES OF DENTISTS | 7.1% | 1279 | 47515.85 |
| GROCERY & RELATED PRODUCT WHSLE | 5.5% | 1123 | 52397.98 |
| OUTPATIENT CARE CENTERS | 6.2% | 1034 | 53948.07 |
| MEDICAL & DIAGNOSTIC LABORATORIES | 24.3% | 1001 | 72820.92 |

In this data brief, low-wage industries are defined as those with average annual wages under \$40,000; middle-wage industries are those with average annual wages between \$40,000 and \$80,000; and high-wage industries are those with average annual wages over \$80,000.

This data brief was based on an analysis of 4-digit NAICS industry employment data provided by the New York State Labor Department, Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW). Data analyzes job totals in the third quarter of 2011 and the third quarter of 2015, which was the most recent quarter for which QCEW data is available. Wage data is based on end-of-year totals for 2014, the most recent full year for which data is available.

75 Industries With the Most Job Gains in New York City, 2011-2015

| Industry | % Job Growth | Job Growth | Avg Annual Wage |
|-------------------------------------|--------------|------------|-----------------|
| RESTAURANTS AND OTHER EATING PLACES | 27.7% | 55145 | 25462.97 |
| HOME HEALTH CARE SERVICES | 46.9% | 37859 | 25754.93 |
| EMPLOYMENT SERVICES | 29.4% | 17416 | 47769.46 |
| OTHER INFORMATION SERVICES | 78.7% | 15688 | 142009.39 |
| COMPUTER SYSTEMS DESIGN & RELATED | 27.2% | 13328 | 130721.97 |

75 Industries With the Most Job Gains in New York City, 2011-2015

| Industry | % Job Growth | Job Growth | Avg Annual Wage |
|---------------------------------------|--------------|------------|-----------------|
| ADVERTISING & RELATED SERVICES | 22.6% | 13157 | 124085.46 |
| BUILDING EQUIPMENT CONTRACTORS | 28.0% | 12406 | 76340.68 |
| COLLEGES & UNIVERSITIES | 18.4% | 12319 | 73280.47 |
| MANAGEMENT SCIENTIFIC & TECH CONSULT | 28.8% | 9915 | 149072.95 |
| DEPOSITORY CREDIT INTERMEDIATION | 20.0% | 9900 | 162131.73 |
| GROCERY STORES | 18.1% | 9546 | 23039.71 |
| ELEMENTARY & SECONDARY SCHOOLS | 25.2% | 9304 | 51310.08 |
| OTHER FINANCIAL INVESTMENT ACTIVITIES | 15.6% | 9241 | 418328.18 |
| ACCOUNTING-TAX PREP-BOOKKEEPING | 22.1% | 9139 | 107832.53 |
| ARCHITECTURAL ENGINEERING & RELATED | 29.3% | 7695 | 99574.89 |
| INDIVIDUAL & FAMILY SERVICES | 6.1% | 7042 | 27277.91 |
| SERVICES TO BUILDINGS & DWELLINGS | 19.7% | 6638 | 42258.41 |
| RESIDENTIAL BUILDING CONSTRUCTION | 38.8% | 6528 | 53292.30 |
| OFFICES OF PHYSICIANS | 12.1% | 6157 | 80902.49 |
| PERSONAL CARE SERVICES | 27.7% | 6051 | 24838.85 |
| HEALTH & PERSONAL CARE STORES | 15.5% | 5973 | 42817.28 |
| INVESTIGATION & SECURITY SERVICES | 12.7% | 5923 | 30268.04 |
| TRAVELER ACCOMMODATION | 13.3% | 5859 | 60104.33 |
| OTHER AMUSEMENT & RECREATION | 23.6% | 5438 | 30464.54 |
| ACTIVITIES RELATED TO REAL ESTATE | 17.8% | 5437 | 72476.05 |
| MANAGEMENT OF COMPANIES & ENTERPRISES | 8.1% | 5105 | 190573.74 |
| OTHER SCHOOLS & INSTRUCTION | 32.6% | 4859 | 29071.34 |
| CHILD DAY CARE SERVICES | 16.7% | 4290 | 29272.44 |

75 Industries With the Most Job Gains in New York City, 2011-2015

| Industry | % Job Growth | Job Growth | Avg Annual Wage |
|---------------------------------------|--------------|------------|-----------------|
| SPECIAL FOOD SERVICES | 19.7% | 4161 | 32250.54 |
| NONRESIDENTIAL BUILDING CONSTRUC | 27.1% | 3656 | 96587.61 |
| AGENCIES BROKERAGES & OTHER RELATED | 16.5% | 3642 | 146696.99 |
| ELECTRONIC SHOPPING & MAIL-ORDER | 46.0% | 3583 | 83673.83 |
| SUPPORT ACTIVITIES - AIR TRANSPORT | 63.3% | 3383 | 30863.88 |
| PROMOTERS - PERFORMING ARTS & SPORTS | 36.6% | 3282 | 79912.24 |
| DRINKING PLACES (ALCOHOLIC BEVERAGES) | 39.4% | 3273 | 29570.77 |
| SOFTWARE PUBLISHERS | 172.2% | 2791 | 144353.87 |
| SOCIAL ADVOCACY ORGANIZATIONS | 24.5% | 2695 | 66724.65 |
| BAKERIES & TORTILLA MFG | 30.0% | 2670 | 24547.03 |
| DATA PROCESSING HOSTING & RELATED | 51.1% | 2662 | 146796.59 |
| GENERAL MEDICAL & SURGICAL HOSPITALS | 1.8% | 2504 | 78555.24 |
| OFFICES OF OTHER HEALTH PRACTITIONERS | 17.8% | 2435 | 42230.68 |
| SCHEDULED AIR TRANSPORTATION | 8.9% | 2433 | 73363.15 |
| BUSINESS/PROFESSIONAL/LABOR/POLITICAL | 14.0% | 2430 | 85439.57 |
| CLOTHING STORES | 4.3% | 2363 | 38962.41 |
| MOTION PICTURE & VIDEO INDUSTRIES | 6.6% | 2353 | 113159.90 |
| MUSEUMS HISTORICAL SITES & SIMILAR | 19.7% | 2352 | 53674.47 |
| DEPARTMENT STORES | 8.0% | 2240 | 33659.94 |
| SPECIALIZED DESIGN SERVICES | 17.9% | 1934 | 87346.67 |
| SPECIALTY HOSPITALS(EX PSYCH & ABUSE) | 14.7% | 1918 | 99556.87 |
| OTHER PERSONAL SERVICES | 14.0% | 1909 | 33671.71 |
| RESIDENTIAL MENTAL HEALTH & SUBSTANCE | 8.9% | 1897 | 31464.74 |

75 Industries With the Most Job Gains in New York City, 2011-2015

| Industry | % Job Growth | Job Growth | Avg Annual Wage |
|--|--------------|------------|-----------------|
| OFFICES:REAL ESTATE AGENTS & BROKERS | 16.0% | 1844 | 134460.68 |
| OTHER GENERAL MERCHANDISE STORES | 16.6% | 1728 | 21978.54 |
| GRANTMAKING & GIVING SERVICES | 13.0% | 1585 | 84917.19 |
| WHOLESALE ELECTRONIC MARKETS & AGENTS | 13.2% | 1567 | 114770.57 |
| OTHER PROFESSIONAL SCIENTIFIC & TECH | 11.1% | 1566 | 82937.94 |
| SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH & DEVELOPMENT SERV | 10.0% | 1504 | 73079.61 |
| OTHER MISCELLANEOUS STORE RETAILERS | 20.0% | 1495 | 88718.29 |
| FOUNDATION STRUCTURE & BLDG EXTERIOR | 15.3% | 1470 | 64061.68 |
| SCHOOL & EMPLOYEE BUS TRANSPORT | 18.1% | 1453 | 38230.32 |
| PRIVATE HOUSEHOLDS | 8.8% | 1413 | 35980.80 |
| COMMUNITY FOOD & HOUSING & EMERGENCY | 14.6% | 1347 | 41094.84 |
| BUILDING FINISHING CONTRACTORS | 9.6% | 1322 | 62601.93 |
| INSURANCE CARRIERS | 4.2% | 1281 | 158533.48 |
| OFFICES OF DENTISTS | 7.1% | 1279 | 47515.85 |
| CIVIC & SOCIAL ORGANIZATIONS | 13.0% | 1265 | 33334.88 |
| RELIGIOUS ORGANIZATIONS | 6.3% | 1165 | 32936.72 |
| GROCERY & RELATED PRODUCT WHSLE | 5.5% | 1123 | 52397.98 |
| OUTPATIENT CARE CENTERS | 6.2% | 1034 | 53948.07 |
| ACTIVITIES RELATED TO CREDIT INTER | 9.3% | 1024 | 170988.83 |
| APPAREL PIECE GOODS & NOTIONS WHSLE | 3.4% | 1006 | 115136.73 |
| MEDICAL & DIAGNOSTIC LABORATORIES | 24.3% | 1001 | 72820.92 |
| AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR & MAINTENANCE | 10.2% | 967 | 28838.75 |
| BUILDING MATERIAL & SUPPLIES DEALERS | 7.6% | 960 | 37930.88 |

75 Industries With the Most Job Gains in New York City, 2011-2015

| Industry | % Job Growth | Job Growth | Avg Annual Wage |
|--------------------------------------|--------------|------------|-----------------|
| BEER WINE & DISTILLED BEVERAGE WHSLE | 18.8% | 921 | 90747.73 |

75 Industries With the Most Job Losses in New York City, 2011-2015

| Industry | % Job Growth | Job Growth | Avg Annual Wage |
|---------------------------------------|--------------|------------|-----------------|
| SECURITIES & COMMODITY CONTRACTS | -6.2% | -6827 | 398907.76 |
| INSURANCE & EMPLOYEE BENEFIT FUNDS | -93.7% | -4697 | 139542.38 |
| NONDEPOSITORY CREDIT INTERMEDIATION | -15.5% | -4361 | 261793.36 |
| NEWSPAPER/PERIODICAL/BOOK/DIRECTORY | -9.9% | -4354 | 127618.50 |
| NURSING CARE FACILITIES | -6.3% | -2805 | 44696.18 |
| BUSINESS SUPPORT SERVICES | -11.4% | -1615 | 64238.51 |
| CABLE & OTHER SUBSCRIPTION PROGRAM | -13.8% | -1407 | 188916.84 |
| CUT & SEW APPAREL MFG | -7.5% | -1147 | 60430.06 |
| OFFICE ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES | -7.5% | -957 | 193301.01 |
| SECURITIES & COMMODITY EXCHANGES | -43.5% | -937 | 222214.49 |
| MISCELLANEOUS NONDURABLE GOODS WHSLE | -12.2% | -765 | 55963.86 |
| OTHER INVESTMENT POOLS & FUNDS | -64.3% | -764 | 204479.58 |
| NONSCHEDULED AIR TRANSPORTATION | -60.5% | -643 | 97739.33 |
| PRINTING & RELATED SUPPORT ACTIVITIES | -9.1% | -579 | 52617.60 |
| JUNIOR COLLEGES | -41.7% | -570 | 38516.92 |
| OTHER HEAVY & CIVIL ENGINEERING CON | -24.5% | -557 | 91405.72 |
| MISCELLANEOUS DURABLE GOODS WHSLE | -3.2% | -537 | 68217.37 |
| VOCATIONAL REHABILITATION SERVICES | -5.4% | -498 | 33487.09 |
| BOOK PERIODICAL & MUSIC STORES | -11.9% | -488 | 25740.92 |

75 Industries With the Most Job Losses in New York City, 2011-2015

| Industry | % Job Growth | Job Growth | Avg Annual Wage |
|---------------------------------------|--------------|------------|-----------------|
| OTHER RESIDENTIAL CARE FACILITIES | -10.2% | -474 | 36768.78 |
| WIRED TELECOMMUNICATIONS CARRIERS | -2.6% | -370 | 98720.70 |
| WIRELESS TELECOM CARRIERS(EXC SATEL) | -39.7% | -363 | 90355.40 |
| HARDWARE & PLUMBING & HEATING EQUIP | -9.5% | -350 | 71909.29 |
| LEGAL SERVICES | -0.4% | -289 | 139579.47 |
| PSYCH & SUBSTANCE ABUSE HOSPITALS | -13.8% | -273 | 57516.15 |
| OTHER MISCELLANEOUS MFG | -3.3% | -268 | 56733.59 |
| TEXTILE & FABRIC FINISHING & COATING | -22.7% | -252 | 91609.89 |
| UTILITY SYSTEM CONSTRUCTION | -8.8% | -245 | 127038.89 |
| MOTOR VEHICLE PARTS MFG | -50.4% | -244 | 35654.41 |
| LESSORS OF NONFINANCIAL INTANGIBLES | -11.5% | -242 | 118896.89 |
| APPAREL ACCESSORIES & OTHER APPAREL | -28.3% | -216 | 29213.85 |
| OTHER SUPPORT SERVICES | -4.5% | -210 | 62875.46 |
| CONVERTED PAPER PRODUCT MFG | -15.2% | -196 | 56402.65 |
| SEMICONDUCTOR & OTHER ELEC COMPONENTS | -30.7% | -195 | 54113.75 |
| COMMUNICATIONS EQUIPMENT MFG | -23.4% | -191 | 59503.46 |
| SUGAR & CONFECTIONERY PRODUCT MFG | -21.5% | -178 | 34474.71 |
| ELECTRIC LIGHTING EQUIPMENT MFG | -25.3% | -167 | 56165.41 |
| MFG & REP MAGNETIC & OPTICAL MEASUR | -55.3% | -162 | 64506.66 |
| CHARTER BUS INDUSTRY | -16.9% | -155 | 28466.79 |
| SUPPORT ACTIVITIES - WATER TRANSPORT | -9.5% | -149 | 75889.74 |
| OTHER TELECOMMUNICATIONS | -5.2% | -142 | 119889.38 |
| FRUIT & VEGETABLE & SPECIALTY FOOD | -13.1% | -128 | 40319.63 |

75 Industries With the Most Job Losses in New York City, 2011-2015

| Industry | % Job Growth | Job Growth | Avg Annual Wage |
|---------------------------------------|--------------|------------|-----------------|
| VENTILATION HEATING AIR-CONDITIONING | -45.4% | -128 | 38805.91 |
| AUTO PARTS ACCESS & TIRE STORES | -4.0% | -125 | 34625.05 |
| SUPPORT ACTIVITIES - ROAD TRANSPORT | -15.7% | -120 | 32748.67 |
| ELECTRONIC & PRECISION EQUIP REPAIR | -10.5% | -102 | 58932.93 |
| DEATH CARE SERVICES | -3.7% | -98 | 55715.46 |
| PHARMACEUTICAL & MEDICINE MFG | -9.4% | -91 | 119894.68 |
| COMMERCIAL & SERVICE INDUSTRY MACH | -38.1% | -88 | 29695.10 |
| TEXTILE FURNISHINGS MILLS | -16.8% | -85 | 76045.41 |
| BOILER TANK & SHIPPING CONTAINER MFG | -27.4% | -82 | 84905.13 |
| OTHER LEATHER & ALLIED PRODUCT MFG | -21.3% | -76 | 34828.87 |
| FABRIC MILLS | -25.3% | -75 | 65270.70 |
| INTERURBAN & RURAL BUS TRANSPORT | -6.3% | -68 | 49703.93 |
| GENERAL RENTAL CENTERS | -22.5% | -66 | 69601.97 |
| CHEMICAL & ALLIED PRODUCTS WHSLE | -3.9% | -65 | 109050.31 |
| LAWN & GARDEN EQUIP & SUPPLIES STORES | -22.4% | -65 | 39114.26 |
| FARM PRODUCT RAW MATERIAL WHSLE | -35.4% | -57 | 63207.60 |
| LAND & SUBDIVISION | -27.2% | -56 | 108995.49 |
| COMMERCIAL & INDUSTRIAL MACH & EQUIP | -4.8% | -54 | 54697.92 |
| APPAREL KNITTING MILLS | -11.1% | -46 | 41529.19 |
| OTHER NONMETALLIC MINERAL PROD MFG | -15.7% | -40 | 51557.91 |
| OTHER FABRICATED METAL PRODUCT MFG | -13.5% | -39 | 48423.25 |
| ROOMING & BOARDING HOUSES | -6.2% | -32 | 61644.88 |
| NATURAL GAS DISTRIBUTION | -1.4% | -31 | 103406.40 |

75 Industries With the Most Job Losses in New York City, 2011-2015

| Industry | % Job Growth | Job Growth | Avg Annual Wage |
|---------------------------------------|--------------|------------|-----------------|
| CUTLERY & HANDTOOL MFG | -11.4% | -29 | 37650.96 |
| AEROSPACE PRODUCT & PARTS MFG | -4.9% | -28 | 67215.32 |
| PESTICIDE FERTILIZER & AGRIC CHEMICAL | -100.0% | -28 | 35594.00 |
| OTHER TRANSIT & GROUND PASSENGER | -0.4% | -26 | 33807.15 |
| GRAIN & OILSEED MILLING | -42.2% | -19 | 49394.18 |
| DRYCLEANING & LAUNDRY SERVICES | -0.2% | -19 | 21564.49 |
| VEGETABLE & MELON FARMING | -56.3% | -18 | 26267.87 |
| MACHINERY EQUIPMENT & SUPPLIES WHSLE | -0.6% | -17 | 66109.53 |
| FOUNDRIES | -33.3% | -17 | 40404.41 |
| COATING ENGRAVING HEAT TREATING | -3.2% | -14 | 47810.98 |

NEW YORK'S MIDDLE INCOME JOBS is a publication of the Center for an Urban Future written by Jonathan Bowles, researched by Kathleen Gorman and designed by Ahmad Dowla. Image: ["Repairs to Metro-North Viaduct"](#) (CC BY 2.0) by [MTAPhotos](#)

The data brief is a publication of the Center for an Urban Future's Middle Class Jobs Project, a research initiative generously funded by Fisher Brothers and Winston C. Fisher.

General operating support for the Center for an Urban Future has been provided by the Bernard F. and Alva B. Gimbel Foundation; with additional support from the Lucius N. Littauer Foundation and the M&T Charitable Foundation.

CENTER FOR AN URBAN FUTURE (CUF) is a catalyst for smart and sustainable policies that reduce inequality, increase

economic mobility and grow the economy in New York City. An independent, nonpartisan policy organization, CUF uses fact-based research to elevate important and often overlooked issues onto the radar of policymakers and advance practical solutions that strengthen New York and help all New Yorkers participate in the city's rising prosperity.

RELATED PRESS

[Middle class's flight leaves NYC the poorer](#)

Wall Street Journal, by Anne Kadet, May 20, 2016

[Software is officially the fastest growing job in NYC](#)

Technical.ly Brooklyn, by Tyler Woods, May 24, 2016

[Software is officially the fastest growing job in New York](#)

Technica.ly, by Tyler Woods, June 24, 2016

[Can New York's Middle Class Stage a Comeback?](#)

6sqft, by Dana Schulz, May 25, 2016

[Middle-income wages are making a comeback in NYC ... sort of: Report](#)

Metro, by Angy Altamirano, May 24, 2016

[Muddle in the middle as mid-level jobs get scarcer in the city](#)

New York Daily News, May 23, 2016



CENTER FOR AN URBAN FUTURE
120 Wall Street, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10005

cuf@nycfuture.org © All Rights Reserved.