Center for an Urban Future
Innovative Ideas. Independent Policy.



Data - May 2016

The Rise (and Fall) of Middle Wage Industries in NYC

While the share of middle income jobs in New York City has declined over the past couple of decades, there is evidence that industries with middle income wages are staging a bit of a comeback.

by Jonathan Bowles

While the share of middle income jobs in New York City has declined over the past couple of decades, there is evidence that industries with middle income wages are staging a bit of a comeback.

This data brief is a publication of the Center for an Urban Future's Middle Class Jobs Project, a research initiative generously funded by **FISHER BROTHERS** and **WINSTON C. FISHER**.

General operating support for the Center for an Urban Future is provided by the Bernard F. and Alva B. Gimbel Foundation; with additional support from the Lucius N. Littauer Foundation and the M&T Charitable Foundation.

As this analysis shows, middle-wage industries—those with annual salaries between $40,000 and $80,000—accounted for 3 of the 8 sectors with a net gain of at least 10,000 jobs. Additionally, the 75 industries producing the greatest job growth between 2011 and 2015 include a near-equal representation of middle-wage sectors (23), low-wage sectors (24) and high-wage sectors (28). And 23 different middle-wage sectors added at least 1,000 jobs during this period.

Despite these positive trends, however, there are clear signs that middle-income industries in New York still lag behind low-wage and high-wage sectors. Overall, middle wage industries added fewer jobs in the five boroughs (110,880) than high-wage industries (112,919) and low-wage industries (169,613).

Middle income sectors also account for a disproportionately large share of the industries that have been shedding jobs in recent years. Of the 75 industries with the most job losses in the city between 2011 and 2015, 34 were middle-wage sectors,

22 were high-wage sectors and 19 were low-wage sectors. In fact, the 14 industries with the largest net-decline in jobs during this period were all in high-wage (9) and middle-wage (5) sectors.

The two industries with the most job gains in the city during this period both were low-wage industries, paying under $40k. They were:

- Restaurants and other eating places, which had a net gain of 55,145 jobs between 2011 and 2015. Jobs in this industry pay an average of $25,462
- Home Health Care services, which had a net gain of 37,859 jobs during this period. Jobs in this industry pay an average of $25,754.

The good news is that there are a number of middle income sectors that have been adding thousands of jobs in the five borough, several of which have potential for more growth in the years ahead. These high-growth sectors span fields from educational services and construction to health care, the arts and transportation. The 23 middle wage sectors that added at least 1,000 jobs in the city between 2011 and 2015 include:

Industry	% Job Growth	# Job Growth	Wages
EMPLOYMENT SERVICES	29.4%	17416	47769.46
BUILDING EQUIPMENT CONTRACTORS	28.0%	12406	76340.68
COLLEGES & UNIVERSITIES	18.4%	12319	73280.47
ELEMENTARY & SECONDARY SCHOOLS	25.2%	9304	51310.08
SERVICES TO BUILDINGS & DWELLINGS	19.7%	6638	42258.41
RESIDENTIAL BUILDING CONSTRUCTION	38.8%	6528	53292.30
HEALTH & PERSONAL CARE STORES	15.5%	5973	42817.28
TRAVELER ACCOMMODATION	13.3%	5859	60104.33
ACTIVITIES RELATED TO REAL ESTATE	17.8%	5437	72476.05
PROMOTERS - PERFORMING ARTS & SPORTS	36.6%	3282	79912.24
SOCIAL ADVOCACY ORGANIZATIONS	24.5%	2695	66724.65
GENERAL MEDICAL & SURGICAL HOSPITALS	1.8%	2504	78555.24
OFFICES OF OTHER HEALTH PRACTITIONERS	17.8%	2435	42230.68
SCHEDULED AIR TRANSPORTATION	8.9%	2433	73363.15
MUSEUMS HISTORICAL SITES & SIMILAR	19.7%	2352	53674.47

Industry	% Job Growth	# Job Growth	Wages
SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH & DEVELOPMENT SERV	10.0%	1504	73079.61
FOUNDATION STRUCTURE & BLDG EXTERIOR	15.3%	1470	64061.68
COMMUNITY FOOD & HOUSING & EMERGENCY	14.6%	1347	41094.84
BUILDING FINISHING CONTRACTORS	9.6%	1322	62601.93
OFFICES OF DENTISTS	7.1%	1279	47515.85
GROCERY & RELATED PRODUCT WHSLE	5.5%	1123	52397.98
OUTPATIENT CARE CENTERS	6.2%	1034	53948.07
MEDICAL & DIAGNOSTIC LABORATORIES	24.3%	1001	72820.92

In this data brief, low-wage industries are defined as those with average annual wages under $40,000; middle-wage industries are those with average annual wages between $40,000 and $80,000; and high-wage industries are those with average annual wages over $80,000.

This data brief was based on an analysis of 4-digit NAICS industry employment data provided by the New York State Labor Department, Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW). Data analyzes job totals in the third quarter of 2011 and the third quarter of 2015, which was the most recent quarter for which QCEW data is available. Wage data is based on end-of-year totals for 2014, the most recent full year for which data is available.

75 Industries With the Most Job Gains in New York City, 2011-2015

Industry	% Job Growth	Job Growth	Avg Annual Wage
RESTAURANTS AND OTHER EATING PLACES	27.7%	55145	25462.97
HOME HEALTH CARE SERVICES	46.9%	37859	25754.93
EMPLOYMENT SERVICES	29.4%	17416	47769.46
OTHER INFORMATION SERVICES	78.7%	15688	142009.39
COMPUTER SYSTEMS DESIGN & RELATED	27.2%	13328	130721.97

75 Industries With the Most Job Gains in New York City, 2011-2015

Industry	% Job Growth	Job Growth	Avg Annual Wage
ADVERTISING & RELATED SERVICES	22.6%	13157	124085.46
BUILDING EQUIPMENT CONTRACTORS	28.0%	12406	76340.68
COLLEGES & UNIVERSITIES	18.4%	12319	73280.47
MANAGEMENT SCIENTIFIC & TECH CONSULT	28.8%	9915	149072.95
DEPOSITORY CREDIT INTERMEDIATION	20.0%	9900	162131.73
GROCERY STORES	18.1%	9546	23039.71
ELEMENTARY & SECONDARY SCHOOLS	25.2%	9304	51310.08
OTHER FINANCIAL INVESTMENT ACTIVITIES	15.6%	9241	418328.18
ACCOUNTING-TAX PREP-BOOKKEEPING	22.1%	9139	107832.53
ARCHITECTURAL ENGINEERING & RELATED	29.3%	7695	99574.89
INDIVIDUAL & FAMILY SERVICES	6.1%	7042	27277.91
SERVICES TO BUILDINGS & DWELLINGS	19.7%	6638	42258.41
RESIDENTIAL BUILDING CONSTRUCTION	38.8%	6528	53292.30
OFFICES OF PHYSICIANS	12.1%	6157	80902.49
PERSONAL CARE SERVICES	27.7%	6051	24838.85
HEALTH & PERSONAL CARE STORES	15.5%	5973	42817.28
INVESTIGATION & SECURITY SERVICES	12.7%	5923	30268.04
TRAVELER ACCOMMODATION	13.3%	5859	60104.33
OTHER AMUSEMENT & RECREATION	23.6%	5438	30464.54
ACTIVITIES RELATED TO REAL ESTATE	17.8%	5437	72476.05
MANAGEMENT OF COMPANIES & ENTERPRISES	8.1%	5105	190573.74
OTHER SCHOOLS & INSTRUCTION	32.6%	4859	29071.34
CHILD DAY CARE SERVICES	16.7%	4290	29272.44

75 Industries With the Most Job Gains in New York City, 2011-2015

Industry	% Job Growth	Job Growth	Avg Annual Wage
SPECIAL FOOD SERVICES	19.7%	4161	32250.54
NONRESIDENTIAL BUILDING CONSTRUC	27.1%	3656	96587.61
AGENCIES BROKERAGES & OTHER RELATED	16.5%	3642	146696.99
ELECTRONIC SHOPPING & MAIL-ORDER	46.0%	3583	83673.83
SUPPORT ACTIVITIES - AIR TRANSPORT	63.3%	3383	30863.88
PROMOTERS - PERFORMING ARTS & SPORTS	36.6%	3282	79912.24
DRINKING PLACES (ALCOHOLIC BEVERAGES)	39.4%	3273	29570.77
SOFTWARE PUBLISHERS	172.2%	2791	144353.87
SOCIAL ADVOCACY ORGANIZATIONS	24.5%	2695	66724.65
BAKERIES & TORTILLA MFG	30.0%	2670	24547.03
DATA PROCESSING HOSTING & RELATED	51.1%	2662	146796.59
GENERAL MEDICAL & SURGICAL HOSPITALS	1.8%	2504	78555.24
OFFICES OF OTHER HEALTH PRACTITIONERS	17.8%	2435	42230.68
SCHEDULED AIR TRANSPORTATION	8.9%	2433	73363.15
BUSINESS/PROFESSIONAL/LABOR/POLITICAL	14.0%	2430	85439.57
CLOTHING STORES	4.3%	2363	38962.41
MOTION PICTURE & VIDEO INDUSTRIES	6.6%	2353	113159.90
MUSEUMS HISTORICAL SITES & SIMILAR	19.7%	2352	53674.47
DEPARTMENT STORES	8.0%	2240	33659.94
SPECIALIZED DESIGN SERVICES	17.9%	1934	87346.67
SPECIALTY HOSPITALS(EX PSYCH & ABUSE)	14.7%	1918	99556.87
OTHER PERSONAL SERVICES	14.0%	1909	33671.71
RESIDENTIAL MENTAL HEALTH & SUBSTANCE	8.9%	1897	31464.74

75 Industries With the Most Job Gains in New York City, 2011-2015

Industry	% Job Growth	Job Growth	Avg Annual Wage
OFFICES:REAL ESTATE AGENTS & BROKERS	16.0%	1844	134460.68
OTHER GENERAL MERCHANDISE STORES	16.6%	1728	21978.54
GRANTMAKING & GIVING SERVICES	13.0%	1585	84917.19
WHOLESALE ELECTRONIC MARKETS & AGENTS	13.2%	1567	114770.57
OTHER PROFESSIONAL SCIENTIFIC & TECH	11.1%	1566	82937.94
SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH & DEVELOPMENT SERV	10.0%	1504	73079.61
OTHER MISCELLANEOUS STORE RETAILERS	20.0%	1495	88718.29
FOUNDATION STRUCTURE & BLDG EXTERIOR	15.3%	1470	64061.68
SCHOOL & EMPLOYEE BUS TRANSPORT	18.1%	1453	38230.32
PRIVATE HOUSEHOLDS	8.8%	1413	35980.80
COMMUNITY FOOD & HOUSING & EMERGENCY	14.6%	1347	41094.84
BUILDING FINISHING CONTRACTORS	9.6%	1322	62601.93
INSURANCE CARRIERS	4.2%	1281	158533.48
OFFICES OF DENTISTS	7.1%	1279	47515.85
CIVIC & SOCIAL ORGANIZATIONS	13.0%	1265	33334.88
RELIGIOUS ORGANIZATIONS	6.3%	1165	32936.72
GROCERY & RELATED PRODUCT WHSLE	5.5%	1123	52397.98
OUTPATIENT CARE CENTERS	6.2%	1034	53948.07
ACTIVITIES RELATED TO CREDIT INTER	9.3%	1024	170988.83
APPAREL PIECE GOODS & NOTIONS WHSLE	3.4%	1006	115136.73
MEDICAL & DIAGNOSTIC LABORATORIES	24.3%	1001	72820.92
AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR & MAINTENANCE	10.2%	967	28838.75
BUILDING MATERIAL & SUPPLIES DEALERS	7.6%	960	37930.88

75 Industries With the Most Job Gains in New York City, 2011-2015

Industry	% Job Growth	Job Growth	Avg Annual Wage
BEER WINE & DISTILLED BEVERAGE WHSLE	18.8%	921	90747.73

75 Industries With the Most Job Losses in New York City, 2011-2015

Industry	% Job Growth	Job Growth	Avg Annual Wage
SECURITIES & COMMODITY CONTRACTS	-6.2%	-6827	398907.76
INSURANCE & EMPLOYEE BENEFIT FUNDS	-93.7%	-4697	139542.38
NONDEPOSITORY CREDIT INTERMEDIATION	-15.5%	-4361	261793.36
NEWSPAPER/PERIODICAL/BOOK/DIRECTORY	-9.9%	-4354	127618.50
NURSING CARE FACILITIES	-6.3%	-2805	44696.18
BUSINESS SUPPORT SERVICES	-11.4%	-1615	64238.51
CABLE & OTHER SUBSCRIPTION PROGRAM	-13.8%	-1407	188916.84
CUT & SEW APPAREL MFG	-7.5%	-1147	60430.06
OFFICE ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES	-7.5%	-957	193301.01
SECURITIES & COMMODITY EXCHANGES	-43.5%	-937	222214.49
MISCELLANEOUS NONDURABLE GOODS WHSLE	-12.2%	-765	55963.86
OTHER INVESTMENT POOLS & FUNDS	-64.3%	-764	204479.58
NONSCHEDULED AIR TRANSPORTATION	-60.5%	-643	97739.33
PRINTING & RELATED SUPPORT ACTIVITIES	-9.1%	-579	52617.60
JUNIOR COLLEGES	-41.7%	-570	38516.92
OTHER HEAVY & CIVIL ENGINEERING CON	-24.5%	-557	91405.72
MISCELLANEOUS DURABLE GOODS WHSLE	-3.2%	-537	68217.37
VOCATIONAL REHABILITATION SERVICES	-5.4%	-498	33487.09
BOOK PERIODICAL & MUSIC STORES	-11.9%	-488	25740.92

75 Industries With the Most Job Losses in New York City, 2011-2015

Industry	% Job Growth	Job Growth	Avg Annual Wage
OTHER RESIDENTIAL CARE FACILITIES	-10.2%	-474	36768.78
WIRED TELECOMMUNICATIONS CARRIERS	-2.6%	-370	98720.70
WIRELESS TELECOM CARRIERS(EXC SATEL)	-39.7%	-363	90355.40
HARDWARE & PLUMBING & HEATING EQUIP	-9.5%	-350	71909.29
LEGAL SERVICES	-0.4%	-289	139579.47
PSYCH & SUBSTANCE ABUSE HOSPITALS	-13.8%	-273	57516.15
OTHER MISCELLANEOUS MFG	-3.3%	-268	56733.59
TEXTILE & FABRIC FINISHING & COATING	-22.7%	-252	91609.89
UTILITY SYSTEM CONSTRUCTION	-8.8%	-245	127038.89
MOTOR VEHICLE PARTS MFG	-50.4%	-244	35654.41
LESSORS OF NONFINANCIAL INTANGIBLES	-11.5%	-242	118896.89
APPAREL ACCESSORIES & OTHER APPAREL	-28.3%	-216	29213.85
OTHER SUPPORT SERVICES	-4.5%	-210	62875.46
CONVERTED PAPER PRODUCT MFG	-15.2%	-196	56402.65
SEMICONDUCTOR & OTHER ELEC COMPONENTS	-30.7%	-195	54113.75
COMMUNICATIONS EQUIPMENT MFG	-23.4%	-191	59503.46
SUGAR & CONFECTIONERY PRODUCT MFG	-21.5%	-178	34474.71
ELECTRIC LIGHTING EQUIPMENT MFG	-25.3%	-167	56165.41
MFG & REP MAGNETIC & OPTICAL MEASUR	-55.3%	-162	64506.66
CHARTER BUS INDUSTRY	-16.9%	-155	28466.79
SUPPORT ACTIVITIES - WATER TRANSPORT	-9.5%	-149	75889.74
OTHER TELECOMMUNICATIONS	-5.2%	-142	119889.38
FRUIT & VEGETABLE & SPECIALTY FOOD	-13.1%	-128	40319.63

75 Industries With the Most Job Losses in New York City, 2011-2015

Industry	% Job Growth	Job Growth	Avg Annual Wage
VENTILATION HEATING AIR-CONDITIONING	-45.4%	-128	38805.91
AUTO PARTS ACCESS & TIRE STORES	-4.0%	-125	34625.05
SUPPORT ACTIVITIES - ROAD TRANSPORT	-15.7%	-120	32748.67
ELECTRONIC & PRECISION EQUIP REPAIR	-10.5%	-102	58932.93
DEATH CARE SERVICES	-3.7%	-98	55715.46
PHARMACEUTICAL & MEDICINE MFG	-9.4%	-91	119894.68
COMMERCIAL & SERVICE INDUSTRY MACH	-38.1%	-88	29695.10
TEXTILE FURNISHINGS MILLS	-16.8%	-85	76045.41
BOILER TANK & SHIPPING CONTAINER MFG	-27.4%	-82	84905.13
OTHER LEATHER & ALLIED PRODUCT MFG	-21.3%	-76	34828.87
FABRIC MILLS	-25.3%	-75	65270.70
INTERURBAN & RURAL BUS TRANSPORT	-6.3%	-68	49703.93
GENERAL RENTAL CENTERS	-22.5%	-66	69601.97
CHEMICAL & ALLIED PRODUCTS WHSLE	-3.9%	-65	109050.31
LAWN & GARDEN EQUIP & SUPPLIES STORES	-22.4%	-65	39114.26
FARM PRODUCT RAW MATERIAL WHSLE	-35.4%	-57	63207.60
LAND & SUBDIVISION	-27.2%	-56	108995.49
COMMERCIAL & INDUSTRIAL MACH & EQUIP	-4.8%	-54	54697.92
APPAREL KNITTING MILLS	-11.1%	-46	41529.19
OTHER NONMETALLIC MINERAL PROD MFG	-15.7%	-40	51557.91
OTHER FABRICATED METAL PRODUCT MFG	-13.5%	-39	48423.25
ROOMING & BOARDING HOUSES	-6.2%	-32	61644.88
NATURAL GAS DISTRIBUTION	-1.4%	-31	103406.40

75 Industries With the Most Job Losses in New York City, 2011-2015			
Industry	% Job Growth	Job Growth	Avg Annual Wage
CUTLERY & HANDTOOL MFG	-11.4%	-29	37650.96
AEROSPACE PRODUCT & PARTS MFG	-4.9%	-28	67215.32
PESTICIDE FERTILIZER & AGRIC CHEMICAL	-100.0%	-28	35594.00
OTHER TRANSIT & GROUND PASSENGER	-0.4%	-26	33807.15
GRAIN & OILSEED MILLING	-42.2%	-19	49394.18
DRYCLEANING & LAUNDRY SERVICES	-0.2%	-19	21564.49
VEGETABLE & MELON FARMING	-56.3%	-18	26267.87
MACHINERY EQUIPMENT & SUPPLIES WHSLE	-0.6%	-17	66109.53
FOUNDRIES	-33.3%	-17	40404.41
COATING ENGRAVING HEAT TREATING	-3.2%	-14	47810.98

NEW YORK'S MIDDLE INCOME JOBS is a publication of the Center for an Urban Future written by Jonathan Bowles, researched by Kathleen Gorman and designed by Ahmad Dowla. Image: 'Repairs to Metro-North Viaduct" (CC BY 2.0) by MTAPhotos

The data brief is a publication of the Center for an Urban Future's Middle Class Jobs Project, a research initiative generously funded by Fisher Brothers and Winston C. Fisher.

General operating support for the Center for an Urban Future has been provided by the Bernard F. and Alva B. Gimbel Foundation; with additional support from the Lucius N. Littauer Foundation and the M&T Charitable Foundation.

CENTER FOR AN URBAN FUTURE (CUF) is a catalyst for smart and sustainable policies that reduce inequality, increase

economic mobility and grow the economy in New York City. An independent, nonpartisan policy organization, CUF uses fact-based research to elevate important and often overlooked issues onto the radar of policymakers and advance practical solutions that strengthen New York and help all New Yorkers participate in the city's rising prosperity.

RELATED PRESS

Muddle in the middle as mid-level jobs get scarcer in the city

New York Daily News, May 23, 2016

Middle class's flight leaves NYC the poorer

Wall Street Journal, by by Anne Kadet, May 20, 2016

Software is officially the fastest growing job in NYC

Technical.ly Brooklyn, by Tyler Woods, May 24, 2016

Software is officially the fastest growing job in New York

Technica.ly, by Tyler Woods, June 24, 2016

Can New York's Middle Class Stage a Comeback?

6sqft, by Dana Schulz, May 25, 2016

Middle-income wages are making a comeback in NYC … sort of: Report

Metro, by Angy Altamirano, May 24, 2016

CENTER FOR AN URBAN FUTURE
120 Wall Street, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10005

cuf@nycfuture.org © All Rights Reserved.